

CLERK

Jill Nowak  
(231) 723-3331

CONTROLLER/ADMINISTRATOR

Thomas Kaminski  
(231) 398-3500

DRAFT

## **GREEN TEAM/RECYCLING COMMITTEE**

Thursday, May 31, 2012  
1:00 P.M.

Manistee County Courthouse & Government Center  
Board of Commissioners Meeting Room

### **REPORT**

Members Present: Glenn Lottie; Carl Rutske; and Jim Krolczyk

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Mary Pitcher, Recycling Site Monitor; Sarah Archer, Iris Waste Diversion Specialists; Andrea Cosier, Manistee County Library; Dennis Hill, Maple Grove Township Trustee; Thomas D. Kaminski, County Controller/Administrator; Dick Jenkins, Manistee Conservation District; Jim Draze, Village of Kaleva; Bruce Schimke, Maintenance Supervisor; Chip Johnston, Centra Wellness Network; George Kaminski, Cleon Township; Anne Kaminski, Cleon Township; LaVonne Beebe, Onekama Township; Dick Hitchingham, Springdale Township; Marlene Wood-Zylstra, Cleon Township; and Rachel Nelson, Administrative Secretary

The meeting was called to order at 1:00 P.M.

### **ITEMS REQUIRING BOARD ACTION**

Ms. Archer presented information on the recycling program, including a program report, 2012 recycling data, 2011 program costs, and 2012 cost projections (APPENDIX A). According to Ms. Archer's calculations, the recycling program fund had a surplus of \$1,793.12 after 2011, but will have a deficit of \$15,725.26 after 2012. Mr. Kaminski announced that Mary Pitcher has decided to resign as the Recycling Site Monitor. Ms. Wood-Zylstra suggested that when the contract with Allied Waste expires at the end of 2012, the new RFP have a not-to-exceed dollar amount. Mr. Draze noted that residents from non-participating townships and businesses are using the recycling containers. Ms. Wood-Zylstra explained the business program that Benzie County uses for their P.A. 69 recycling sites. Those present stated that they like the program and hope it continues. Ms. Nelson stated that Greg Wisner, Arcadia Township Trustee, was not able to attend the meeting, but did call to say that the recycling program is working well in their township. It was noted that the education and outreach component of the program is very important. After discussion,

**Mr. Rutske recommended that the P.A. 69 recycling program continue in Manistee County and that up to \$20,000 from the County's General Fund be allocated to supplement the program. No alternative recommendation was proposed.**

ITEMS NOT REQUIRING BOARD ACTION

Ms. Cosier stated that the Library now has three containers for waste - one for trash, one for paper, and one for clear plastic. The paper and plastic are recycled.

The meeting adjourned at 2:25 P.M.

---

Glenn Lottie, Chairperson

---

Carl Rutske, Commissioner

---

Jim Krolczyk, Commissioner

[m h:\reports\green team 053112]

**Manistee County Green Team  
PA69 Recycling Program Report - May 31, 2012 rev  
Sarah Archer, Iris Waste Diversion Specialists, Inc.**

<b>Current Status</b>
-----------------------

**Seven participating Townships:**

- Arcadia Township
- Brown Township
- Cleon Township/Village of Copemish
- Maple Grove Township/Village of Kaleva
- Marilla Township
- Onekama Township/Village of Onekama
- Springdale Township

**Non-Participating Townships interviewed**

- Dickson Township
- Filer Township
- Manistee Township

**Site Status**

Location	Paper & Cardboard Recycling	Plastic/Metal/Glass Recycling
Arcadia Township Hall 3422 Lake Street/Arcadia	2 – Republic Services 8-cy dumpster	30 cy roll-off
Betsie Valley School 17936 Cadillac Hwy/Thompsonville	Packaging Corp. of America trailer	30 cy roll-off
Brown Township Hall 8233 Coates Hwy/Manistee	1 – Republic Services 8-cy dumpster	30 cy roll-off
Maple Grove/Kaleva Osmo (Healy Lake Rd.) and Walta St./Kaleva	1 – Republic Services 8-cy dumpster	30 cy roll-off
Onekama Township Hall 5435 Main Street/Onekama	Packaging Corp. of America trailer	30 cy roll-off

**Education Status**

- Recycling Volume and Financial Reports for Townships
- Draft of Recycling Guidelines flyer
- Toll-free hotline – 855-2goZero
- Recycling 101 Presentation
- Recycling Survey
- Volunteermatch.org account
- Summer Event Educational Tables
  - Spirit of the Woods – June 16
  - Kaleva Days – July 20-22
  - Onekama Days – August 3-5
  - Manistee County Fair – August 21-25

## Program Cost Analysis

### 2011 Cost Analysis Summary

- Recycling Fees covered cost of program with fund balance of \$1,793.12
- Collection costs and service to roll-off containers account for the highest costs each month
- Highest costs occur during high volume summer months June – September at all locations

### 2012 Cost Projection Summary

- Tonnages and roll-off service pulls were estimated to increase by 10% and associated costs for processing were based on the 10% estimate.
- Collection costs are based on Republic Services 3<sup>rd</sup> year extension rate per contract
- Site monitoring costs were estimated to increase by 10%
- Program Education costs are a fixed rate per contract
- Based on current Township participation in the recycling program and an estimated 10% increase in tonnages, associated costs, site monitoring and program education, and with nearly \$1,800 dollars in carry over from 2011, the recycling fees collected will fall short of covering the costs of the program by nearly \$14,000.00.
- Cost projections are based on current level of Township participation. Recruitment of additional Townships will reduce the deficit of program funds.

## Program Recommendations

- As collection costs represent the highest costs to the program, closer monitoring of loads and service schedules may result in higher efficiencies in collection expenditures.
- Establish local site monitors to maximize space and minimize service pulls to roll-offs and sites with paper recycling dumpsters.
  - To maximize space
    - remove contamination
    - utilize tools to move materials to reduce air space
    - educate resident's on proper recycling to reduce contamination
    - educate about preparation of recyclables to "flatten" plastics, metals, cardboard
  - Develop procedures for identifying persons/businesses disposing of unacceptable items and contacting them regarding proper use of recycling drop-off
- Establish a method for gaining monetary contributions from local businesses and non-PA69 users.
- The collection contract with Republic Services/Allied Waste expires at the end of 2012. A competitive bid for service may result in lower costs and increased opportunities for the recycling program.
- Plastic bag recycling will shift from separate collection barrel to being accepted in roll-off container beginning by mid-June.
- Alkaline batteries manufactured after 1997 no longer contain mercury so are safe to dispose of with regular trash. It is recommended that collection of alkaline batteries be discontinued and a rechargeable battery collection program established after the August Household Hazardous Waste event held by the Manistee Conservation District. Call2Recycle is a free collection program for rechargeable batteries and cell phones. Countertop collection boxes are available and come with postage paid shipping labels to return to the Rechargeable Battery Recycling Corporation.
- Develop resident education plan to improve quality of participation
  - Train a volunteer corps for community events
  - Develop signage for drop-off sites
  - Create recycling guidelines flyer for Townships
  - Expand recycling information on Manistee County website

- While the projected costs of the PA69 Recycling Program portrays a picture of an underfunded program, continuation of the program is recommended for the following reasons:
  - The County Recycling program is in its early stages of development and being watched by non-participating Townships to see what happens. There is a lack of confidence in the County programs and the lack of cooperation in the past continues to hamper the progress of the program. However, the recycling program offers an opportunity to establish a cooperative spirit through the strategic development of a sound and comprehensive recycling program.
  - The current political climate in Lansing is in favor of cooperative programs and will link future funding to the level of cooperation in a region. The County Recycling program can serve as a model of cooperation and demonstrate the shared benefits of a county-wide program.
  - Residents and businesses value the 24/7 availability of the recycling drop-off sites.
  - The recycling program supports the local economy and local schools.
  - The recycling program has attracted recycling businesses to the County.
  - Visitors from larger metropolitan areas are accustomed to recycling. The availability of recycling while away from home is a positive reason to vacation in Manistee County.
  - Recycling is an activity that is viewed as protecting the environment and therefore aligns with the image of Manistee County as a paradise of vast natural beauty.
  - Through the recycling program, Manistee County can serve as the main source of environmental information for all available recycling and special waste handling.
  - Recycling is a key component of Manistee County Solid Waste Plan.
  - With the need for economic growth across this state and across our nation, waste is now being seen as a resource and recycling is the way of the future.

#### Recruitment Challenges

- All remaining townships, with the exception of Filer Township, currently offer recycling drop-off for residents for the same or additional materials than offered through the PA69 Recycling Program.
- Myth or Fact? - "We can recycle cheaper ourselves". The validity of this statement has not been determined. The cost of the recycling services to each Township is still being gathered for comparison to the PA69 program.
- There are a number of variables that affect the costs of the recycling programs of non-PA69 Townships which make comparison often an "apples to oranges" scenario.
- Getting face time with elected officials to gather information about current services and data.

#### Recruitment Positives

- The majority of recycling drop-off programs offered by non-PA69 Townships is open to residents on a limited basis during the hours of operation of the waste transfer station. 24/7 access to recycling is a benefit of the PA69 program.
- Resident recycling education is limited or non-existent. The PA69 program offers professional, coordinated recycling education and support.
- Data collection is limited or non-existent. Monitoring and reporting of recycling volumes is a function of the PA69 program and is a valuable educational, planning and decision making tool.
- With the addition of new Townships, the value of the program will increase in the form of cohesive, uniform communication to residents, increased visibility and awareness of the program, and leverage when negotiating for contracted collection services.

## Manistee County Recycled Materials by Site per Month

	Paper (cubic yards)	Plastic/Metal/Glass (ton)
<b>JANUARY</b>		
Arcadia Twp.	64	1.34
Betsie Valley	0	2.74
Brown Twp	30	1.44
Maple Grove Twp	64	1.23
Onekama Twp	0	3.56
<b>January Total</b>	<b>158</b>	<b>10.31</b>
<b>FEBRUARY</b>		
Arcadia Twp.	64	0.00
Betsie Valley	0	1.89
Brown Twp	30	0.00
Maple Grove Twp	64	1.15
Onekama Twp	0	3.16
<b>February Total</b>	<b>158</b>	<b>6.20</b>
<b>MARCH</b>		
Arcadia Twp.	40	1.52
Betsie Valley	0	1.28
Brown Twp	27	1.61
Maple Grove Twp	73	1.51
Onekama Twp	0	2.22
<b>March Total</b>	<b>140</b>	<b>8.14</b>
<b>APRIL</b>		
Arcadia Twp.	64	1.56
Betsie Valley	0	1.18
Brown Twp	32	1.65
Maple Grove Twp	64	1.20
Onekama Twp	0	3.48
<b>April Total</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>9.07</b>
<b>YEAR TO DATE TOTALS</b>	<b>616</b>	<b>33.72</b>

Month	Roll-off Tonnage (Actual)	Roll-off Recycling Processing per Ton (Actual)	Roll-off Rental (Actual)	Roll-off Service (Actual)	Paper Container Service Fee (Actual)	Total Collection Costs (Actual)	Site Monitoring (Actual)	Program Education (Actual)	Other	Total Per Month (Actual)
January	4.56	\$182.40	\$458.08	\$1,035.00	\$455.10	\$2,130.58	N/A	N/A		\$2,130.58
February	7.08	\$283.20	\$475.00	\$1,725.00	\$490.00	\$2,973.20	N/A	N/A		\$2,973.20
March	3.21	\$128.40	\$475.00	\$1,035.00	\$490.00	\$2,128.40	included in May	N/A		\$2,128.40
April	4.40	\$176.00	\$475.00	\$1,725.00	\$490.00	\$2,866.00	included in May	N/A		\$2,866.00
May	5.00	\$200.00	\$475.00	\$1,725.00	\$490.00	\$2,890.00	\$1,081.19	N/A		\$3,971.19
June	16.61	\$664.40	\$475.00	\$3,105.00	\$522.22	\$4,766.62	included in July	N/A		\$4,766.62
July	16.46	\$658.40	\$475.00	\$3,105.00	\$588.00	\$4,826.40	\$1,838.17	N/A		\$6,664.57
August	16.19	\$647.60	\$475.00	\$3,450.00	\$588.00	\$5,160.60	included in Sept	N/A		\$5,160.60
September	13.57	\$542.80	\$475.00	\$2,415.00	\$588.00	\$4,020.80	\$860.83	\$1,760.00		\$6,641.63
October	8.85	\$382.24	\$606.90	\$2,703.41	\$673.64	\$4,366.19	included in Nov	\$1,600.00		\$5,966.19
November	5.59	\$240.82	\$606.90	\$2,312.78	\$673.64	\$3,834.14	\$1,206.86	\$2,000.00		\$7,041.00
December	6.34	\$273.39	\$606.90	\$1,930.15	\$673.64	\$3,484.08	\$926.46	\$1,200.00	\$6.36	\$5,616.90
<b>TOTAL COSTS</b>	<b>107.86</b>	<b>\$4,379.65</b>	<b>\$6,078.78</b>	<b>\$26,266.34</b>	<b>\$6,722.24</b>	<b>\$43,447.01</b>	<b>\$5,913.51</b>	<b>\$6,560.00</b>	<b>\$6.36</b>	<b>\$55,926.88</b>
<b>Average/Month</b>	<b>8.99</b>	<b>\$364.97</b>	<b>\$506.57</b>	<b>\$2,188.86</b>	<b>\$560.19</b>	<b>\$3,620.58</b>	<b>\$657.06</b>	<b>\$1,640.00</b>	<b>\$0.53</b>	<b>\$4,660.57</b>

<b>TOTAL TOWNSHIP RECYCLING FEES COLLECTED</b>	<b>\$57,720.00</b>
<b>MINUS TOTAL ALL COSTS</b>	<b>\$55,926.88</b>
<b>BALANCE</b>	<b>\$1,793.12</b>

PER SITE DATA							
Recycling Site	Roll-off Tonnage (Actual)	2011 Parcel Count	Township Recy Fees Assessed (\$13.00/HH)	Collection Cost (Actual)	Site Monitoring (Actual)	Prog Education (Actual)	Total Costs (Actual)
Arcadia Twp	15.54	594	\$7,722.00	\$5,812.51	\$791.13	\$877.62	\$7,481.26
Betsie Valley Schl*	24.14	1,454	\$18,902.00	\$14,227.92	\$1,936.54	\$2,148.25	\$18,312.71
Brown Twp	8.74	436	\$5,668.00	\$4,266.42	\$580.70	\$644.18	\$5,491.29
Maple Grove Twp	11.12	715	\$9,295.00	\$6,996.53	\$952.29	\$1,056.40	\$9,005.22
Onekama Twp	48.32	1,241	\$16,133.00	\$12,143.64	\$1,652.85	\$1,833.55	\$15,630.04
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>107.86</b>	<b>4,440</b>	<b>\$57,720.00</b>	<b>\$43,447.01</b>	<b>\$5,913.51</b>	<b>\$6,560.00</b>	<b>\$55,920.52</b>
<b>Actual Per Parcel Costs</b>				<b>\$9.79</b>	<b>\$1.33</b>	<b>\$1.48</b>	<b>\$12.59</b>

\*Serves Cleon Township (575) Village of Copemish, Marilla Township (243), Springdale Township (636)

A-5

Month	Roll-off Tonnage (Actual)	Roll-off Recycling Processing Per Ton (Actual)	Roll-off Rental (Actual)	Roll-off Service (Actual)	Paper Container Service Fee (Actual)	Total Collection Costs (Actual)	Site Monitoring (Actual)	Program Education (Actual)	Other	Total Per Month (Actual)
January	10.04	\$417.66	\$494.00	\$2,870.40	\$509.60	\$4,291.66	\$651.94	\$1,200.00		\$6,143.60
February	6.20	\$257.91	\$494.00	\$1,435.20	\$509.60	\$2,696.71	\$719.60	\$2,000.00		\$5,416.31
March	8.14	\$338.64	\$494.00	\$2,152.80	\$509.60	\$3,495.04		\$1,600.00		\$5,095.04
April	10.07	\$418.91	\$494.00	\$2,511.60	\$509.60	\$3,934.11	\$758.03	\$1,600.00		\$6,292.14
<b>TOTAL TO DATE</b>	<b>34.45</b>	<b>\$1,433.12</b>	<b>\$1,976.00</b>	<b>\$8,970.00</b>	<b>\$2,038.40</b>	<b>\$14,417.52</b>	<b>\$2,129.57</b>	<b>\$6,400.00</b>		<b>\$22,947.09</b>
<b>Average/Month</b>	<b>8.61</b>	<b>\$358.28</b>	<b>\$494.00</b>	<b>\$2,242.50</b>	<b>\$509.60</b>	<b>\$3,604.38</b>	<b>\$532.39</b>	<b>\$1,600.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$5,736.77</b>

Month	Roll-off Tonnage (Estimated <sup>1</sup> )	Roll-off Recycling Processing per Ton (Estimated <sup>2</sup> )	Roll-off Rental Fee (Fixed) (\$102.75 per month X 5 recycling sites)	Roll-off Service Pulls (Estimated <sup>3</sup> )	Paper Container Service Fee (Fixed <sup>4</sup> ) (\$106.00 per month x 4 containers)	Total Collection Costs (Estimated)	Site Monitoring (Estimated <sup>5</sup> )	Program Education (Fixed)	Other	Total Per Month
May	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,600.00		\$6,247.02
June	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,600.00		\$6,247.02
July	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,600.00		\$6,247.02
August	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,600.00		\$6,247.02
September	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,600.00		\$6,247.02
October	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,800.00		\$6,447.02
November	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,800.00		\$6,447.02
December	10.525	\$455.31	\$513.75	\$2,531.20	\$424.00	\$3,924.26	\$722.76	\$1,800.00		\$6,447.02
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>118.65</b>	<b>\$5,075.61</b>	<b>\$6,086.00</b>	<b>\$29,219.60</b>	<b>\$5,430.40</b>	<b>\$45,811.61</b>	<b>\$7,911.65</b>	<b>\$19,800.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$73,523.26</b>

<sup>1</sup>Tonnage estimate calculation = 118.65 (10% increase in 2011 Tonnage estimate) minus 34.45 (2012 Actual Tonnage Jan-Apr 2012) = \$84.30 divided by remaining 8 months (May-Dec) = 10.525

<sup>2</sup>Calculation = Roll-off Tonnage multiplied by contracted recycling processing fee of \$43.26 per ton

<sup>3</sup>Estimate based on 10% increase in roll-off service (pulls) per month from 2011 (74 pulls). 81.4 pulls at \$373.15 = \$30,374.41 divided by 12 months = \$2,531.20.

<sup>4</sup>Paper recycling containers only at Arcadia Township (2), Brown Township (1), Maple Grove Township (1). Betsie Valley School & Onekama Township have PCA trailers for paper recycling.

<sup>5</sup>Estimate based on 10% increase from 2011 monthly average of \$657.06 = 722.76.

<b>TOTAL TOWNSHIP RECYCLING FEES COLLECTED</b>	<b>\$57,798.00</b>
<b>MINUS ACTUAL &amp; ESTIMATED COSTS</b>	<b>\$73,523.26</b>
<b>ESTIMATED PROGRAM BALANCE</b>	<b><u>-15,725.26</u></b>

A-6



PER SITE DATA							
	Roll-off Tonnage	2012 Parcel Count	Township Recy Fees Assessed (\$13.00/HH)	Estimated Collection Cost	Estimated Site Monitoring Cost	Estimated Program Education Cost	Estimated Total Costs
Arcadia Twp		597	\$7,761.00	\$6,149.10	\$1,062.66	\$2,656.65	\$9,868.41
Betsie Valley Schl*		1,453	\$18,889.00	\$14,965.90	\$2,586.34	\$6,465.85	\$24,018.09
Brown Twp		434	\$5,642.00	\$4,470.20	\$772.52	\$1,931.30	\$7,174.02
Maple Grove Twp		715	\$9,295.00	\$7,364.50	\$1,272.70	\$3,181.75	\$11,818.95
Onekama Twp		1,247	\$16,211.00	\$12,844.10	\$2,219.66	\$5,549.15	\$20,612.91
<b>TOTALS</b>		<b>4,446</b>	<b>\$57,798.00</b>	<b>\$45,793.80</b>	<b>\$7,913.88</b>	<b>\$19,784.70</b>	<b>\$73,492.38</b>
<b>Actual Per Parcel Counts</b>				<b>\$10.30</b>	<b>\$1.78</b>	<b>\$4.45</b>	<b>\$16.54</b>
*Serves Cleon Township (568), Village of Copemish, Marilla Township (244), Springdale Township (641)							

A-7